# Scenario Best Practices

# Claire Lang-Ree Sustainable FERC Project, NRDC

SUSTAINABLE FERC PROJECT



### Goals

- 1. Enhance PJM's transmission planning process to plan on a forwardlooking basis for known determinants and produce actionable, costeffective plans.
- 2. Ensure:
  - 3. Reliability
  - 4. Efficient interconnection of new resources
  - 5. Efficient markets

Scenarios are crucial to identify least-regrets transmission solutions.





# **Creating Scenarios**

Transmission planners should create realistic scenarios that **incorporate 7 factors**, and are plausible and diverse.



#### Order 1920 Requirements: Scenario Inputs

- At least three plausible and diverse Long-Term Scenarios based upon best available data
- Seven required factors. Factors 1-3 cannot be discounted, factors 4-7 must be considered



## **Scenario Inputs**

#### **Required Factor Categories**

- 1. Laws and regulations affecting future resource mix and demand
- 2. Laws and regulations on decarbonization and electrification
- 3. Integrated Resource Plans and expected supply obligations for LSEs
- 4. Trends in technology and fuel costs within and outside of the electricity supply industry, including shifts toward electrification of buildings and transportation

#### 5. Retirements

- 6. Generation interconnection requests and withdrawals
- 7. Utility and corporate commitments and other public policy goals

Must be included. Vary based on probability weighting





## **Scenario Inputs**

Factors 4-7 can vary across scenarios based on probabilistic weighting.

- Probability of Factors 4-7 must be based on best available data\*
- Justification for probability weighting must be transparent and developed with stakeholder input.
- A reasonable amount of Factors 4-7 must be in the minimum scenario. "No change" is not a plausible future.
- Highest scenario must be approaching fully decarbonized system.

Scenarios must be diverse enough to represent different visions of the future, but also each must be premised on a sound reasoning to produce useful findings with which to identify least regrets transmission projects.

\* See presentation by Nick Lawton from Earthjustice.



#### **Scenario Inputs**

Base Scenario should be realistic based on inputs. Additional scenarios should explore major risk variations that impact the future system.



NRD

# **Using Scenarios**

Transmission planners should use scenarios to **identify needs** and **evaluate transmission solutions**.



#### Scenarios have Two Functions:

### Need Identification:

Identify transmission needs for the future electricity system Benefits and Selection:\*

Evaluate solutions for benefits and cost effectiveness while minimizing risk across variables

\* See presentation by Tom Rutigliano from NRDC.



#### Scenario Use for Need Identification

- Use base scenario to identify likely reliability violations caused by the future electricity system.
- Use scenarios 2 and 3 to look at additional risks that might materialize due to increases in Factors 4-7.
- Use sensitivities to evaluate low probability, high risk events.



#### Scenario Use for Need Identification



NRDC

# Sensitivities

Scenarios should capture major variables in the future, but sensitivities can adjust for tail-end events: low probability, high impact. Extreme weather needs to be part of each scenario, but there might be additional scenarios that PJM experts wish to use.

Guiding questions:

- What is a 1-in-10 event in the 2040s?
- Are we planning to 1-in-10, or something more robust?
- What is the interaction between weather and reliability? Might be nonlinear.



#### Scenarios have Two Functions:

#### Need Identification:

Identify transmission needs for the future electricity system

#### **Benefits and Selection:**\*

Evaluate solutions for benefits and cost effectiveness while minimizing risk across variables

\* See presentation by Tom Rutigliano from NRDC.





### Scenario Use for Benefits and Selection

Solutions should be evaluated in all scenarios to quantify benefits for each one.

More holistic solutions might show additional benefits in scenarios 2 and 3. All solutions must solve the needs in the base scenario.



### **Other Considerations**

- Significant PJM staff time, effort, and judgement will be required to make this a reality.
- NRDC and partners stand ready to support PJM to make this process functional and efficient.



# Thank you!

Claire Lang-Ree Sustainable FERC Project, NRDC clangree@nrdc.org

SUSTAINABLE FERC PROJECT

